

# **Station 03: Historical Assessments of Thinking**

## **Directions:**

There are two assessments at this station. Each asks you questions about a primary source.

Complete the assessment for each primary source. Make sure you flip the assessment sheets over to complete the back.

Open the folders containing the grading rubrics to see how you did on the assessment and get examples of student responses.

**Directions:** Use the document and background information to answer the question that follows.

**Source:** Japanese artist Utagawa Hiroshige made this print in 1861. It depicts life in America at the time.



**Title:** “Picture of Flourishing America”

**Additional facts related to Picture of Flourishing America:**

1. Utagawa Hiroshige was a famous print artist in Japan at the time.
2. American naval officer Commodore Matthew Perry was one of the people most responsible for forcing Japan to open its harbors to Western trade in the 19th century.
3. The building in the back is identical to Frederiksborg Castle in Denmark, images of which had appeared in international newspapers the year that this print was made.

CONTINUE ON BACK

**Question:** Which 1 of the 3 facts above might cause you to question the reliability of the print as evidence of life in America at this time?

Fact \_\_\_\_\_ might cause me to question the reliability of the print because \_\_\_\_\_

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

## ***Rubric – Japan and America HAT***

To answer this question correctly, students must select Fact 3 and explain how it might lead them to question the reliability of the print. Fact 3 suggests that the print includes images from Denmark, which calls into question whether the author was basing the print on information about the United States at the time.

LEVEL	DESCRIPTION
Proficient	Student selects the correct fact and explains how it casts doubt on the reliability of the document.
Emergent	Student selects the correct fact but does not provide an adequate or complete explanation of how it would lead them to question the reliability of the document.
Basic	Student does not select the correct fact or selects the correct fact but does not provide a relevant explanation.

**Directions:** Use the painting to answer the question below.



**Title:** “The First Thanksgiving 1621”

**By:** J.L.G. Ferris

**Date painted:** 1932

**Question:** The painting, “The First Thanksgiving 1621,” helps historians understand the relationship between the Wampanoag Indians and the Pilgrim settlers in 1621.

Do you agree or disagree? (Circle one).

Briefly support your answer:

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

## ***Rubric – The First Thanksgiving HAT***

To answer the question correctly, students must notice both the date of the event (1621) and the date of the painting (1932) and understand that the intervening time makes it a less useful source for a historian trying to learn about the first Thanksgiving.

LEVEL	DESCRIPTION
Proficient	<p>Student explains why the time gap limits the reliability of the source as evidence of what happened at the first Thanksgiving.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li> <p><b>Example: accuracy</b>  <u>Sample Student Response:</u>  <i>Disagree. This painting was drawn 311 years after the actual event happened. There is no evidence of historical accuracy, as we do not know if the artist did research before painting this, or if he just drew what is a stereotypical Pilgrim and Indian painting.</i></p> </li> <li> <p><b>Example: crucial date</b>  <u>Sample Student Response:</u>  <i>Disagree. Disregarding the accuracy of the portrait – and I’m not sure if Wampanoag is the right tribe – it would be pretty ridiculous for alleged historians to try and study the 1600s from a portrait painted in 1932.</i></p> </li> <li> <p><b>Example: other sources</b>  <u>Sample Student Response:</u>  <i>Disagree. I disagree with this statement because this painting is not a primary source document. The painting was originally made in 1932, roughly 320 years after “The First Thanksgiving.” Thus it is a secondary source document and should not be the main resource used to learn about this Thanksgiving or the relationship between the two. A good source might be Puritan letters during this time.</i></p> </li> </ul>

Emergent	<p>Student evaluates reliability of source but does not fully explain the problems caused by the gap in time.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Example: perspective of artist</b>  <u>Sample Student Response:</u>  <i>Disagree. It is impossible to know whether this picture actually happened. Just one person drawing about it doesn't mean it is true or that it actually happened.</i></li> <li>• <b>Example: motivation of artist</b>  <u>Sample Student Response:</u>  <i>Disagree. Painted by a white person from Europe, of course they will be extremely biased in order to bring to light a highly positive image of the Europeans as to excite more foreign expeditions (because 'the Indians look so friendly and thankful').</i></li> <li>• <b>Example: type of source</b>  <u>Sample Student Response:</u>  <i>Disagree. No picture can really give you an understanding of the relationship between two groups. Artists cannot be accurate.</i></li> </ul>
Basic	<p>Student does not recognize the gap in time and instead takes the painting at face value or provides an irrelevant response.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Example: matching</b>  <u>Sample Student Response:</u>  <i>Agree. True, because you can see how they are interacting with each other. Without any picture, you couldn't really see how Wampanoag Indians and the Puritans interacted with each other.</i></li> <li>• <b>Example: clarity of source</b>  <u>Sample Student Response:</u>  <i>Agree. Because within this painting we can see how their relationship was before the outburst of colonization.</i></li> <li>• <b>Example: critical</b>  <u>Sample Student Response:</u>  <i>Disagree. As soon as the settlers arrived, there was mass curiosity, which turned into violence and hatred. There was never such a "party" between the two peoples. They couldn't even understand each other.</i></li> </ul>